
Marie T. Mora, Alberto Dávila, and Havidán Rodríguez
The University of Texas – Pan American

Presented at the ACS Data Users Conference Washington, DC – May 30, 2014
Introduction

• In Puerto Rico, the Great Recession “started earlier and was much steeper than that on the U.S. mainland” (NY Fed 2012:4), and was compounded by a fiscal crisis and other deteriorating conditions.

• These conditions have led to an exodus of Puerto Ricans from the island.

• The population in the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico fell on net by 5.6% between 2006 and 2011.
• Given its severity, the time around the recession is a “natural experiment” to analyze skill-related changes in the net migration of Puerto Ricans.

• The importance of studying Puerto Ricans is made clear when considering they are the second largest Hispanic group.

• There are now more Puerto Ricans living on the mainland than the island (4.9 versus 3.7 million).

• Their poverty rates are also quite high, on both the island and mainland.
Using ACS and PRCS data, we examine skill-related changes for four groups of Puerto Ricans through synthetic cohorts.

*Observed* = education levels

*Unobserved* = unexplained earnings differences with non-Hispanic mainland workers

- Average education levels fell among island-born Puerto Ricans on the mainland.

- But their relative earnings also improved, which was not the case for those on the island.
Economic Crisis in Puerto Rico

**Weak Labor Market**

- Island-born Puerto Rican LFP rates:
  - 46.2% in 2006, but 44.7% in 2011 on island;
  - 52.5% in 2006, but 51.7% in 2011 on mainland.

**2006 Fiscal Crisis In Puerto Rico**

- 7.0% sales tax (from 0%) imposed in 2006 (*Impuesto a las Ventas y Uso - IVU*)
- Regressivity may have led to outmigration of low- to medium-income (skill) groups.
• During this crisis, the Puerto Rican government also reduced public-sector jobs.

• *Our estimates:* 16% loss (“state”) and 8.7% loss (local) = 40,000 total loss in public-sector jobs.

• The presence of middle- and low-skilled workers in sub-federal government jobs fell.

**Complete Expiration of IRS Code Section 936**

• Section 936 exempted U.S. corporations from paying income taxes on profits earned from items produced in Puerto Rico.
• These tax breaks were phased out (1996 to 2006).

• *Our estimates*: 27,000 manufacturing jobs were lost in Puerto Rico (20% decline) 2006-2011.

• The displaced workers seem to be middle-skilled workers.

*Increasing Returns to Schooling*

• For island-born Puerto Ricans, education returns were 8.6% (island and mainland) in 2006, but 8.9% (island) versus 7.9% (mainland) in 2011.
• This change may have led to net migration of low- to medium-skilled workers from the island.

**Job Polarization on Mainland**

• If migration costs inversely relate to skills, the middle-skilled workers should have migrated.

• But the mainland experienced job polarization (loss of middle-skilled jobs), not the island.

• How these changes affected skill-based migration thus becomes an empirical issue.
ACS and PRCS IPUMS Data


• We construct a synthetic cohort to study four Puerto Rican groups:
  - Island-born, Island Residents
  - Island-born, Mainland Residents
  - Mainland-born, Island Residents
  - Mainland-born, Mainland Residents
**Synthetic cohorts:** Individuals 25 years old in 2006 can be tracked through individuals ages:
- 26 in 2007
- 27 in 2008
- 28 in 2009…
Usually excluding immigrants who arrived to the U.S. after 2006.

- Migration between Puerto Rico and the mainland is not an issue, given the PRCS.
Figure 1:
Average Schooling Levels of Puerto Ricans in the Synthetic Cohort: 2006-2011, by Birthplace and Residence
Methodology and Results for Unmeasured Skills (via Unexplained Earnings)

• Using the Oaxaca-type earnings decomposition technique, for non-Hispanics workers on the mainland, we first estimate:

$$\ln(\text{Earnings}^{NH}) = \chi^{NH} \beta^{NH} + e^{NH}.$$ 

• Imputing Puerto Rican earnings using $\beta$ estimates, we then calculate the unexplained earnings gaps vis-à-vis mainland-resident non-Hispanics.
Figure 2: Unexplained Earnings Differences between Puerto Ricans and Non-Hispanic Mainland Workers in the Cohort: 2006-2011
Summary and Concluding Remarks

• The timeframe 2006-2011 provides an ideal backdrop to study how deteriorating economic conditions affect skill levels in net migration flows between Puerto Rico and the continental U.S.

• Our results are mixed.

• Puerto Rico appeared to experience a “brain gain” in terms of observable skills (measured by education).

• But the island seemed to have a net loss of unobservable skills (unexplained earnings gaps).
• One potentially alarming characteristic of the Puerto Rican labor market, should it continue, is the low labor force participation rate.

• In addition to discouraged worker effects, the island’s income tax structure might affect work incentives (e.g., lack of EITC).

• A restructuring of income taxes might generate higher labor force participation in Puerto Rico, while yielding poverty-reducing outcomes.

• We expect such changes to improve the average socioeconomic status of Puerto Ricans.
Thank you.

Marie T. Mora
Professor of Economics
Department of Economics and Finance
The University of Texas - Pan American
1201 W. University Drive
Edinburg, Texas 78539-2999
(956) 665-7913; FAX (956) 665-5020
mtmora@utpa.edu

Alberto Dávila
Professor of Economics and V.F. “Doc” and
Gertrude M. Neuhaus Chair for Entrepreneurship
The University of Texas - Pan American

and

Havidán Rodríguez
Professor of Sociology
The University of Texas - Pan American